

**CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DATE OF MEETING: Tuesday, March 1, 2016
TIME OF MEETING: 4:00 p.m.
PLACE OF MEETING: City Commission Chambers, City Hall

AGENDA

- I. Call to Order
- II. Elections (Chair and Vice-chair)
- III. Approval of Minutes of the regular meeting of February 2, 2016
- IV. Old Business
 - None
- V. New Business
 - Case 2016-03 – 38 Diana Ave – Siding/Fence
- VI. Other Business
- VII. Adjourn

“We admire that which is old not because it is old, but because it is beautiful.” Winston Churchill

AMERICAN DISABILITY ACT POLICY FOR ACCESS TO OPEN MEETING OF THE
CITY COMMISSION AND ANY OF ITS COMMITTEES OR SUBCOMMITTEES

The City of Muskegon will provide necessary reasonable auxiliary aids and services, such as signers for the hearing impaired and audio tapes of printed materials being considered at the meeting, to individuals with disabilities who want to attend the meeting, upon twenty-four hour notice to the City of Muskegon. Individuals with disabilities requiring auxiliary aids or services should contact the City of Muskegon by writing or calling the following:

Ann Marie Cummings, City Clerk
933 Terrace Street
Muskegon, MI 49440
(231) 724-6705

TTY/TDD: Dial 7-1-1 and request that representative dial 231-724-6705

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

February 2, 2016

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, S. Kroes, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke

MEMBERS ABSENT: K. Panozzo, D. Warren

STAFF PRESENT: M. Franzak, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: W. Barnhart, MSI Construction, 4420 W Bard Rd, Whitehall

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of January 5, 2016 was made by L. Wood, supported by J. Hilt and unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS

Case 2016-02 – 621 W Western Avenue. Applicant: Muskegon Eagles. District: Clay-Western. Current Function: Recreational. This case was tabled from the January meeting, as the board needed more information before making a decision. The applicant is seeking approval to replace the metal and glass entry door to the bowling alley on Western Ave. They are also proposing modifications to the entryway including removal of the sidelights and transom windows around the door, and replacement of those with vinyl siding, similar to the door located to the right of the main door shown in photos provided. Staff does not recommend approval of the door and entryway replacement as proposed, as it does not meet the Historic District Commission Standards.

W. Barnhart stated that the Eagles wished to replace the entry door, as the metal was rusting and it was an eyesore. They proposed to eliminate the sidelights and replace them with brown board and batten siding, to match the other entryway. The replacement glass in the door would be half-view, not full-view. He stated that the elimination of the glass in and around the door would alleviate some security concerns. Board members discussed project details with the applicant. A. Riegler was concerned that the proposed changes did not meet HDC standards. S. Radtke stated that the configuration of the door and windows should remain the same. J. Hilt explained the board's concerns to W. Barnhart. He stated that he would go back and work with the people at the Eagles to come up with an acceptable proposal. A. Riegler suggested that he look at the other historic buildings downtown for ideas, and asked that he submit a drawing of the proposed new entryway when he returned before the board.

A motion to table this case until the March meeting to have the applicant submit a new proposal that met HDC standards, was made by J. Hilt, supported by S. Radtke and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, S. Kroes, L. Wood, A. Riegler, and S. Radtke voting aye.

NEW BUSINESS

None.

OTHER BUSINESS

Legislation regarding Historic District Commissions. Board members and staff discussed pending legislation to eliminate historic district commissions in Michigan. S. Radtke stated that he had been in Lansing earlier in the day to oppose the measure.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:30 p.m.

Case 2016-03 – 38 Diana Ave
Applicant: Bethany Housing Ministries
District: McLaughlin
Current Function: Residential

Discussion

The applicant is seeking approval to cover the wood siding on the lower portion of the house with vinyl siding and to wrap the soffit and fascia with aluminum. Please note that the upper portion of the house has vinyl shake.

They are also requesting to add a vinyl privacy fence in the back yard.



Standards

RESIDING AND TRIM CLADDING GUIDELINES

(Adopted December 6, 1994 - Effective January 1, 1995)

General

The Muskegon Historic District Commission does not endorse the residing of structures within the Historic districts. It is the policy of this Commission that the original fabric of the building should be repaired or replaced where necessary with the original building material. Therefore, residing and trim cladding in Class AA districts shall not be approved.

In cases in Class A districts where the repair or replacement with like materials is impractical or where it can be demonstrated that the original materials will no longer hold paint or that the original materials are so badly deteriorated that they can no longer be reasonably repaired, the residing standards below shall strictly be adhered to.

Definitions

For the purpose of this statement, the terms "residing materials" and "trim cladding" shall be understood to encompass the use of any residing materials such as aluminum, vinyl, steel, hardboard, wood, masonry, or molded urethane which is designed to replace or cover all, or any part, of an exterior wall, trim work or other building element or a structure within a designated historic district.

Purpose

The Commission shall review all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness proposing the installation of residing materials or trim cladding as individual cases. Each application shall be decided on its own merit. No person should interpret any Commission approval for residing or trim cladding as being precedent setting. Unrestricted use of residing materials or trim cladding will not be allowed.

In any case where residing materials or trim cladding are proposed for use by a property owner or siding contractor, the property owner shall be required to submit a signed letter stating in detail the intent and scope of the proposed residing or trim cladding installation. Such a letter is to also include the identification of any deterioration or problems occurring relative to the existing siding or exterior building fabric. If known, the cause and extent of this deterioration must be clearly stated.

The following conditions of installation shall be met by all proposals for residing or trim cladding:

1. All existing deterioration shall be made structurally sound and its causes, insofar as possible, shall be corrected prior to the installation of residing materials or trim cladding.
2. Any installation of residing materials shall simulate the appearance of the original building material that it is intended to cover. This simulation shall take into account the size, shape or profile, texture, and linear direction of the original building material.

- (a) The residing material shall be similar in appearance and dimension to the original siding. The exposure to the weather of the new siding shall range within one inch of the nominal dimension of the original siding. The Historic District Commission shall have the authority to waive this requirement in the event that they believe a different design or dimension siding would be more appropriate to the architectural character of the Historic District.
 - (b) A proposed color shall be appropriate as determined by the Commission.
 - (c) Generally, wood grain textures are not approved by the Commission. However, the appropriateness of a specific siding texture shall be determined on an individual case basis.
3. Any installation of trim cladding shall adhere to the following guidelines for the treatment for architectural trim elements.
- (a) Existing cornice or building trim elements shall not be covered or replaced without Commission approval. Commission approval will depend upon how closely the trim cladding or new trim elements duplicate the appearance of the existing building trim elements.
 - (b) The wall siding material shall not extend over the existing trim members such as window and door trim, sills, fascias, soffits, frieze members and boards, brackets, aprons, corner boards, trim boards, skirt boards, or any other characteristic moldings or architectural features (see attached illustration).
 - (c) If the above mentioned trim members are to be clad, they shall be covered with custom formed cladding which shall closely approximate the shapes and contours of the existing moldings or trim. Distinctive or unusual trim or architectural elements shall not be clad without prior consideration and Commission approval.
 - (d) No building trim elements or architectural features are to be removed or altered to facilitate the installation of the new siding or trim cladding without approval of the Historic District Commission.
 - (e) In most cases the soffit cladding material shall run parallel and not perpendicular to the plane of the wall.

Deliberation

I move that the HDC (approve/deny) the request to install the vinyl fence, to cover the wood siding with vinyl, and to wrap the soffit and fascia with aluminum as proposed, with the conditions that 1) all architectural features are retained, 2) all zoning requirements are met, and 3) any necessary permits are obtained.